GUSTAV MAHLER'S
1895 re-orchestration of

BEETHOVEN
SYMPHONY No. 9

***Leah Anne Myers**, soprano*
***Ilene Sameth**, mezzo-soprano*
***James Clark**, tenor*
***Richard Conant**, bass-baritone*

Brno Philharmonic Orchestra
Janáček Opera Choir

conducted by
Peter Tiboris

BCD 9033

Ludwig van Beethoven

(1770-1827)

Symphony No.9, Op.125, in D minor

1895 Gustav Mahler Edition

1	**I Allegro, ma non troppo un poco maestoso**	**(15:55)**
2	**II Molto vivace**	**(11:40)**
3	**III Adagio molto e cantabile**	**(15:31)**
4	**IV Finale: Presto - Allegro assai**	**(24:45)**

Leah Anne Myers, soprano • Ilene Sameth, mezzo-soprano
James Clark, tenor • Richard Conant, bass-baritone

Brno Philharmonic Orchestra
Janáček Opera Choir
(Josef Pančík, choirmaster)

Peter Tiboris, conductor

℗ and ©1992 Bridge Records, Inc. All Rights Reserved

Total Time: 68:06

Had Gustav Mahler (1860-1911) been granted a substantial longevity, he would undoubtedly have remained musically active until the 1930's. That hypothetical activity, moreover, might have meant a phonographic legacy for posterity comparable to those left by Mahler's three great near-contemporaries, Richard Strauss (1864-1949), Felix Weingartner (1863-1942) and Arturo Toscanini (1867-1957).

Alas! It was not to be: Mahler died young and it fell to another great conductor, Artur Nikisch (1855-1922), to make the first record of a complete symphony (the Beethoven Fifth, in 1913, with the Berlin Philharmonic). All we know first hand of Mahler the performer (as opposed to Mahler the composer) are a few fragments of his symphonies in Welte Mignon piano rolls — notoriously unreliable, if nonetheless intriguing.

Fortunately, there is a plenitude of secondary evidence to console us: for one, there are the (often conflicting) interpretations by various Mahler disciples — Oscar Fried (1871-1941), Willem Mengelberg (1871-1951), Bruno Walter (1876-1962) and Otto Klemperer (1885-1973). And, more importantly, we have the various arrangements and re-orchestrations that Mahler left behind as residue from his activities as a re-creative musician. All of these "bones" are, of course, useful to musical archaeologists, but — given the wildly divergent conducting styles of Fried, Mengelberg, Walter and Klemperer — it is Mahler's editorial work that furnishes the most tangible and conclusive evidence of what his performances might have been like; the real clue, if you will, to "the Mahler Sound".

Since the emergence of the public recital as an institution in the early nineteenth century, charismatic performers have captured the public's imagination (and usually its heart as well). Paganini and Liszt, with their innovative virtuosity, were suspected of having made a pact with the devil, and, at the very least, popular artists were, if not adored, likened to magicians. In our more

scientific, analytical age, the "charisma," "magnetism" and "wizardry" can (thanks to records, videos and performer editions) be accounted for in far more down-to-earth terms. Violin pedagogues the world over turn out pupils who have easy mastery over Paganini's "diabolic" effects, and pianists know the arsenal of tricks — added octaves in the bass, extra fifths added to those already there, left hand slightly ahead of right hand to bring out "orchestration."

And so it is with conductors, as well. We know, by following his recordings with score, that Stokowski's plush opulance was largely obtained through adjustments of dynamics, by free bowing, or by having the violas, say, hold through a rest and thus impinge on the listener's consciousness. Similarly, Furtwängler achieved many of **his** vaunted effects through judicious (and sometimes outrageous) tempo manipulation. Likewise, the famous Toscanini clarity was **not** merely a by-product of superlative precision, a keen ear for balance and a tyrannical discipline, but was, as oft as not, achieved by way of adjustment of dynamics and rescorings not all that different from Stokowski's. (Toscanini, most certainly, did not play everything exactly as written!)

And so, too, with Mahler. Maestro Peter Tiboris's observations on Mahler's 1895 reorchestration of Beethoven's *Ninth Symphony*, reprinted after these notes, list the numerous changes made by that eminent musician. Some of them will be familiar from other conductors' performances. Wagner's essay on the interpretation of Beethoven provided grist for many of his musical descendants. The adjustments of dynamics in the climactic recapitulation of the first movement, recommended by Wagner, are heard, similarly, in Mahler's version (as well as on the recordings of Weingartner, Furtwängler and Toscanini, to name but three utterly dissimilar interpretations). Also shared by these, and many other practitioners are the brass doublings of the woodwind lines in the *Scherzo*. Several factors are at work: for one thing, the larger halls used for public performances called for a larger body of strings, and thus, or so Romantic conductors maintained, demanded doubled or even quadrupled woodwinds and help from the expanded brass section. It was partly a matter of balance, but also a question of the prevailing aesthetic: a weighty, burnished, "sensuous" (e.g., Wagnerian) sound was desirable and, thus, sought after by performers. (It is interesting to note that many of the great nineteenth century

auditoriums — for instance, the Grösser Musikvereinsaal in Vienna, with its characteristic echo — added their own acoustical "gravy" to the sonority.)

Mahler, however, went further in his adjustments than did most of his eminent colleagues, calling for extensive re-distributions of string parts, an additional set of timpani (with their own part), and the interpolation of four(!) extra horns (again with autonomous material). Lest we think that Mahler was a child of his times, candor compels me to note that his tinkerings evoked the disapproval — nay, the wrath — of many contemporary musicians. Brahms, according to Ernst Krenek, called Mahler "the most incorrigible revolutionist" and Henry Krehbiel, reviewing his New York concerts, criticized him constantly. Still, Mahler was a dedicated interpreter and his expansion of Beethoven's masterpiece, in its way and for all its excesses, does sincere honor to the music. Of his 1895 re-orchestration Mahler wrote: "far from following any arbitrary purpose or course, but also without allowing himself to be led astray by `tradition', [this conductor] was constantly and solely concerned with carrying out Beethoven's wishes in their minutest detail, and ensuring that nothing the master intended should be sacrificed or drowned out amid the general confusion of sound." Thus stated, Mahler's responsibly radical attitude toward the re-creative art seems light years removed from the learned objectivity of so many present-day practitioners.

This recording, in any event, enables us to hear how a distinguished artist of a by gone epoch paid homage to a milestone of Western Classical Music. It triumphantly re-affirms the universality of Beethoven's vision.

Harris Goldsmith, 1992

The following are some observations and comments by Peter Tiboris relating to the 1895 Mahler edition of Beethoven's *Ninth Symphony in D minor.*

There are four general considerations in the 1895 Mahler edition:

1) The extensive alteration of dynamic markings throughout the score, particularly making use of such dynamic extremes as *pppp*, *ppp*, *ffff* and *fff*. The original scoring makes use of the dynamic ranges of *pp* and *ff* only.
2) The extensive use of an additional set of timpani and four additional French horns.
3) The pervasive doublings which occur in the woodwinds and strings throughout the score.
4) The occasional introduction of new counter-melodic material.

Curiously, two other items should be noted:

1) There are no changes in the vocal scoring for chorus or soloists from the original.
2) There are no changes in tempo indications from the original.

While there are numerous observations that could be made, the following are the most significant ones:

Movement I

Throughout the first movement, Mahler frequently adds second violins to double the first violins in the same octave where one finds them tacit in the original scoring. By virtually doubling the number of violinists in the upper register of the violin line, the quality becomes more soaring in nature. Measures 14 through 35 illustrate this revision. The celli are added in octaves, giving more fiber to the inner structure of the movement.

Generally, whenever there is a forceful moment, Mahler increases the doubling throughout the orchestra, especially in the woodwinds and brass, adding an "inner strength" to the work. The only trade-off engendered by doing this is that the writing becomes less transparent than in the original. In short, there is less harmonic space and more weight created.

The horns have a larger part to play in Mahler's version, beginning with the first

introduction of horns 5 and 6 at measure 14 with pedal tones and continuing through measure 35. At measure 51 the horns have new counter-melodic material; horns 1 and 2 are made to double the string parts.

There is extensive added woodwind writing between measures 138 and 164, especially in the use of doublings. Of particular interest is Mahler's added use of the bassoon and horn parts between measures 179 and 204.

In measures 310 through 338, all eight horns are playing, creating a moment of great power and strength that is vintage Mahler. In measure 338, they have their own counter-melodic material, with horns 1-4, in a sense, competing with horns 5-8. Many added woodwind and brass doublings occur in this section as well. After measure 484, woodwinds and brass have extensive doublings to bolster the original score's inner strength, particularly on the accented sections of the strings. The second timpani is added in this section as well.

The added horns enter again at measure 512 with their own counter-melodic material. The second timpani is heard throughout the first movement, with particular force at measure 138 and beyond. The use of second timpani is extensive and continues to the end of the movement.

Movement II

After measure 93 of the second movement, all eight horns play for 17 measures with additional woodwind doublings throughout this section. Doubling and new melodic material can be heard here as a counter melody.

Between measures 330 and 334, there are added woodwind and brass parts.

Horns 5-8 are added at *presto* (measure 412), while woodwinds are added to double the previously written flute parts.

Second timpani can be heard throughout the accented sections to add more rhythmic vitality.

Movement III

The third movement has the least number of revisions. However, Mahler has added the first horn to the famous fourth horn solo as a counter melody at the *Adagio*, measure 83. That is, the first horn plays separate material from the fourth horn through the *Lo stesso tempo*.

Interestingly, beginning at measure 115, Mahler makes extensive use of Flute II and this continues through measure 120. There are no other rewritings except for the last two measures of the movement where the second flute doubles the first flute. Dynamic revisions are more prevalent here than in any other movement except possibly the fourth.

Movement IV

The most interesting addition in the fourth movement is of all violas doubling the celli and bass solo/recitative, giving the opening solo/recitatives a more dramatic and yet, sometimes, lyric quality. Also, there is rewriting for horns 4-6 and the woodwinds, and abundant doublings can be heard from the very beginning.

After measure 172, extensive wind and horn parts are either rewritten or used in doubling, with extra timpani added throughout.

There is additional bassoon writing before measure 288 and dynamics are changed to *ffff* and *pppp*. More horn rewriting at measure 317 to double the horns playing above them can be observed, up to *allegro assai alla marcia*. Double timpani occurs throughout, as well, with the use of more woodwinds between measures 516 and 567.

Horns 5-8 are added for rhythmic intensity four measures before the *andante maestoso*, (measure 595). The horns enter during the middle section adding more fabric and body with doubling in the woodwinds.

At the *Allegro energico sempre ben marcato* in measure 655, horns 1-4 are added to the above four horns for inner strength, and counter-melodic material for the additional horns is heard. At the *prestissimo* in measure 851, all horns play with the woodwinds doubling. In measure 916 of the *finale*, a driving force is created by all added instruments playing and double timpani is added as well.

In the last five bars, the celli double the woodwinds in their last triplet run with the trombones, trumpet and brass doubling the strings. The horns double the woodwinds with all sections playing triplets. The entire orchestra plays, adding propulsion and one final monumental crescendo.

The **Brno Philharmonic Orchestra's** distinguished history includes the appointment, in 1875, of Leoš Janáček as chief conductor. It was only in the post-World War II years, however, that the Philharmonic would become a full-time ensemble. Since then the orchestra has performed throughout Europe and made highly successful tours in North America and Japan. The Philharmonic has made several hundred recordings, and has been led by such eminent guest conductors as Charles Munch, Jean Meylan, Dean Dixon, Janos Ferencsik, Charles Mackerras, Rafael Kubelik, and Gennadij Rozdestvensky. The Brno Philharmonic Orchestra is presently headed by conductor Leoš Svárovský, with Caspar Richter, conductor of the Vienna State Opera, permanent guest conductor.

The **Janáček Opera Choir** and its conductor, Josef Pancík, are in residence at the State Theater of Brno. There, the highly acclaimed choir has performed and recorded a wide range of music, from chamber to grand opera.

Leah Anne Myers, soprano, made her international operatic debut in 1988 with the Hungarian State Opera in Budapest as Gilda in *Rigoletto*. Her debut then led to invitations to perform in Yugoslavia and Italy. Ms. Myers recently participated in the Far East Tour of Ambassadors of Opera World Wide, and was the sole winner of the Concurso Internazionale per Voci Nuove Belliniane in Catania, Sicily. She holds a bachelor's and a master's degree in music from the Manhattan School of Music.

Ilene Sameth, mezzo-soprano, has appeared with many regional opera companies, including the Des Moines Metro Opera, Minnesota Opera Central City, and Mississippi Opera, as well as with companies in Italy, England and the Middle East. Among the roles she has performed recently are Giulietta in *The Tales of Hoffman*, La Principessa in *Suor Angelica*, Siebel in *Faust*, and Prince Orlovsky in *Die Fledermaus*. She has been a finalist in both the Chicago Lyric and the Metropolitan Opera National Council Auditions and was the winner of the New Jersey Verismo Opera Association Vocal Competition. She is a graduate of the Eastman School of Music.

James Clark, tenor, made his professional debut at Carnegie Hall in 1971, in Mahler's *Eighth Symphony*. He has been a member of the Metropolitan Opera Studio, and has appeared at the New York City Opera for twelve years in over fifty roles. Residing in Germany now, he made his debut in Gottfried von Einem's *Tulifant*. Mr. Clark received a master's degree in voice and opera from the Manhattan School of Music.

Richard Conant, bass-baritone, has concertized throughout Spain singing the bass solos in Handel's *Messiah*; has toured the People's Republic of China with concert pianist Raymond Dudley, giving concerts and masterclasses. He is a professor of music at the University of South Carolina, and is the founder of the South Carolina Philharmonic Chorus. Mr. Conant holds degrees from UCLA, the University of Maryland, and the University of Texas.

Producer: Peter Řezníček
Engineer: Jindřich Michalík
Assistant Engineer: Otakar Tajovský
Mastering: David Starobin, Paul Zinman, Peter Tiboris

Recorded at Dukla Radio Studio, Brno;
in June and December, 1991

Artistic Assistance: Leoš Svárovský,
Principal Conductor, Brno Philharmonic Orchestra

Cover Art: P. Craig Russell
Photograph: Fredric Petters
Design: Digital Chameleon
Album Coordination: Norman Dunfee, Donna Ceparano, Sara Bong for MidAmerica Productions;
Becky Starobin, Carolyn Finger, Michael Calvert for Bridge Records.

Conductor **Peter Tiboris**, founder and music director of New York's Manhattan Philharmonic, has been a great champion of the 1895 Mahler Edition of Beethoven's *Ninth Symphony*, performing it with distinguished ensembles in many corners of the world — with the Manhattan Philharmonic in Carnegie Hall, with the Brno Philharmonic at the State Theater in Brno, and with the Glinka Cappella Symphony Orchestra and Chorus at St. Petersburg's Great Shostakovich Hall, and on tour with the Radio and Television Symphony Orchestra of Moscow in Madrid, Granada, Caceres, and on the Spanish Mediterannean islands of Mallorca and Ibiza. In addition to the aforementioned orchestras, Peter Tiboris has received critical praise for his work with The Philharmonia and the Royal Philharmonic Orchestras of Great Britain; Yugoslavia's Dubrovnik Symphony; Poland's Poznan Philharmonic and the Polish Philharmonic Chamber Orchestra of Warsaw; Bulgaria's Plovdiv Opera Orchestra and Chorus; Russia's Glinka Philharmonic of St. Petersburg, and the Radio and Television Symphony Orchestra of Moscow; the Kiev Opera Symphony Orchestra; the Niedersächsische Staatsorchester of Hannover, Germany; New York's American Symphony Orchestra and, of course, the Manhattan Philharmonic, which he has led in more than 25 concerts during the past five years in Carnegie Hall and Lincoln Center's Avery Fisher Hall.

Peter Tiboris has conducted the first New York performances of Schnittke's *Concerto for Piano and Strings*, Dohnanyi's *Stabat Mater*, Bruckner's *Psalm 112*, Constantinides's *Lament of Antigone*, Dello Joio's *Nativity: A Canticle for the Child*, Nielsen's *Hymnus Amoris*, Tchaikovsky's *Ode to Joy*, the 1874 Critical Edition of Verdi's *Requiem*, and Philip Glass's *The Canyon*, as well as the United States premieres of Taneyev's *Symphony No.4 in C minor, op.12* and Mozart's sacred drama *Die Schuldigkeit des Ersten Gebots* and the world premieres of Constantinides's *Byron's Greece* and *Hymn to the Human Spirit*. Mr. Tiboris's next recording for Bridge Records will be the Taneyev *Symphony No.4 in C minor*, and the Taneyev arrangement of Tchaikovsky's *Romeo and Juliet Overture Fantasy* for soprano, tenor and orchestra.

COMPACT disc DIGITAL AUDIO

824

DIGITAL STEREO • BCD 9033

Total Time: 68:06

DDD

DIGITAL STEREO

Ludwig van Beethoven

(1770-1827)

Symphony No. 9, Op. 125, in D minor

(1895 Gustav Mahler Edition)

1	I Allegro, ma non troppo un poco maestoso	(15:55)
2	II Molto vivace	(11:40)
3	III Adagio molto e cantabile	(15:31)
4	IV Finale: Presto–Allegro assai	(24:45)

Leah Anne Myers, soprano • Ilene Sameth, mezzo-soprano
James Clark, tenor • Richard Conant, bass-baritone

Brno Philharmonic Orchestra
Janáček Opera Choir
(Josef Pančík, choirmaster)

Peter Tiboris, conductor

℗ and © 1992 Bridge Records, Inc.
All Rights Reserved
Mfg. in USA

Beethoven: *Symphony No. 9* (Mahler Edition)

BCD 9033